

## WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

**Wednesday 14 September 2011**

**COUNCILLORS PRESENT:** Councillors Van Nooijen (Chair), Goddard (Vice-Chair), Benjamin, Cook, Gotch, Jones, Khan, Price and Tanner.

**OFFICERS PRESENT:** Alec Dubberley (Democratic Services Officer), Murray Hancock (City Development), Michael Crofton-Briggs (Head of City Development), Steven Roberts (City Development), Nick Worlledge (City Development) and Jeremy Thomas (Head of Law and Governance)

### **37. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS**

None received.

### **38. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Colin Cook, Personal, a former student of Queen's College.

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Colin Cook, Personal, an employee of the University of Oxford.

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Elise Benjamin, Personal, had received a petition on the development as Lord Mayor.

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen, Personal, a member of Oxford University and Queen's College.

3. St Clement's Car Park And Public Convenience, St Clement's Street, Oxford - 11/01044/CAC.

Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen, Personal, had extensive contact with a number of objectors to the application which included a meeting at a local pub.

6. Grove House Club, Grove Street, Summertown, Oxford: 11/01165/FUL.

Councillor Michael Gotch, Personal, a family member is a former member of the Grove Club.

8. 15 Farndon Road, Oxford. 11/01942/FUL.

Councillor Bob Price, Personal, personal friend of the applicant.

8. 15 Farndon Road, Oxford. 11/01942/FUL.

Councillor Colin Cook, Personal, personal friend of the applicant.

8. 15 Farndon Road, Oxford. 11/01942/FUL.  
Councillor John Tanner, Personal, personal friend of the applicant.

8. 15 Farndon Road, Oxford. 11/01942/FUL.  
Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen, Personal, personal friend of the applicant.

**39. ST CLEMENT'S CAR PARK AND PUBLIC CONVENIENCE, ST CLEMENT'S STREET, OXFORD - 11/01044/CAC AND 11/01044/CAC**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for the demolition of public toilets and the redevelopment of St Clement's car park to provide student accommodation (141 bedrooms) and ancillary facilities over 3 blocks, Replacement car park (74 spaces), public toilets and landscaping and ancillary works.

The Planning Officer reported that there had been additional comments received from Oxford University, Queen's College and a number of other local residents. These representations, he added, did not raise any further matters that were not covered in the report.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Nik Lyzba, Alan Berman, Linda Irving Bell, Clint Pugh, Laurence Schafer and Sarah Wild spoke in objection to the development. The objectors spoke about concerns regarding the capacity of the proposed new car park, the architectural significance of the nearby Florey building, anxiety felt by neighbouring shopkeepers due to lost business and general concerns regarding the overall suitability of the scheme for the St Clement's area.

Iain Smith and Aiden Cosgrove, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in support of the development outlining reasons they believed the scheme was suitable for the site.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:-

- (1) The development is unacceptable because it relates poorly to its general context and the setting of nearby listed buildings in respect of its height, scale, form and massing. The proposed development would have an adverse impact on views into and out of this part of the St Clements and Iffley Road Conservation Area - to the detriment of the character and appearance of both the conservation area in question and the adjacent Central Conservation Area - as well as on the setting of the grade II listed Florey Building and 27 St Clements Street. This adverse impact would affect the conservation areas and the listed building settings to an unacceptable extent. The application is contrary to policy CP1, CP8, CP10, HE3 and HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001 - 2016 and policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026.
- (2) The development is unacceptable because it would have an overbearing impact on and result in a loss of privacy to neighbouring properties, to the detriment of residential amenity, in

respect of its height, scale, bulk and proximity to the site boundaries. This overbearing impact would impinge on residential amenity to an unacceptable extent. The application is contrary to policy CP1, CP10 and HS19 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001 - 2016.

- (3) The development is unacceptable because it fails to provide satisfactory replacement car park facilities as required by policy DS82 and TR11 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001 - 2016. The number of proposed car parking spaces on site, and the location of the proposed temporary replacement car park do not represent a satisfactory replacement for the current parking provision at the development site. The application is contrary to policy DS82 and TR11 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001 - 2016.

#### **40. 12A FRIAR'S ENTRY, OXFORD: 11/001814/FUL & 11/01815/CAC**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for the part demolition of existing sub-station building fronting Red Lion Square, erection of part 4 storey, part 7 storey building to provide 29 en-suite student bedrooms plus the provision of 15 secure cycle parking spaces.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Julian Philcox and Adrian James, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in support of the development.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to grant planning permission subject to a legal agreement.

#### **41. GROVE HOUSE CLUB, GROVE STREET, SUMMERTOWN, OXFORD: 11/01165/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for the demolition of an existing building, erection of two storey terrace (with accommodation in roof space) comprising 1 x 4-bed house and 3 x 3-bed houses and provision of off street parking, bin and cycle storage.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Councillor Jean Fooks (Local Ward Member) spoke in objection to the development raising concerns about overdevelopment of the site and lack of garden space. Pamela Gibson, a neighbouring resident, also spoke in objection to the development. Henry Venners, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in support of the development.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to grant planning permission subject to the conditions in the officer's report, with a variation to the wording of condition 17 to allow future residents to have visitor parking permits.

**42. 66 AND 68 WOODSTOCK ROAD ST ANTONY'S COLLEGE (MIDDLE EASTERN CENTRE), OXFORD:07/02818/FUL, 09/01557/LBC**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a report seeking compliance with condition 4 of the planning permission and condition 3 of the listed building consent for approval of exterior materials for the extension to Middle Eastern Centre to provide new library facilities, common area, lecture room, storage areas.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Jim Heverin, on behalf of the developer, spoke about the materials selected for the building.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to approve the use of polished stainless steel as the cladding for the building.

**43. 15 FARNDON ROAD, OXFORD. 11/01942/FUL**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing a planning application for a part ground floor, part first floor rear extension.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking Judith Lane, a neighbouring resident, spoke in objection to the development stating that the extension would result in an unacceptable loss of light for her property. Peter and Sue Ledwith, the applicants, spoke in support of the development.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to grant planning permission subject to the conditions in the officer's report.

**44. 376 BANBURY ROAD, OXFORD: 11/01928/EXT**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing an application to extend the time limit on planning permission 08/02720/FUL for "Amendments to planning permission 07/02903/FUL (Demolition of existing building, erection of 4 storey building to form 34 bedroom guest house with underground parking area), comprising various alterations to the building approved. Removal of third floor communal roof garden.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to grant the application in principle but to delegate to officers authority to issue the notice of permission upon completion of the legal agreement.

#### **45. 59 - 63 COWLEY ROAD, OXFORD: 11/02020/EXT**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) detailing an application to extend planning permission 08/01382/FUL for demolition of frontage buildings of 61/63 Cowley Road. Retention of rear workshop/store and 59 Cowley Road. Erection of 4 storey building (with basement) and conversion of workshop/store and No.59, to provide 2 shop units on ground floor and 5 flats above (2x2, 2x3, 1x1 bed), with private terrace, communal garden and refuse/recycling/cycle parking store (for 13 bicycles).

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and it was:

Resolved to grant planning permission subject to the conditions in the officer's report.

#### **46. PLANNING APPEALS**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) giving details of planning appeals received and determined during July 2011.

Resolved to note the report.

#### **47. FORTHCOMING APPLICATIONS**

Members noted the following planning applications would be before the Committee at future meetings:-

- 1) Travis Perkins Site, Chapel Street: 11/01712/FUL: Student accommodation.
- 2) St. Hugh's College: 10/01794/FUL & 11/01795/CAC: Student accommodation & Chinese Institute.
- 3) Green Templeton College: 11/01493/FUL: Temporary sports pavilion (call in).
- 4) 15 Farndon Road: 11/01942/FUL: Extensions (call in).
- 5) 46 / 48 Union Street: 11/01966/FUL: Extensions (call in).
- 6) 38 Linkside Avenue: 11/01860/FUL: Extension (call in).
- 7) 1 Wytham Street: 11/02150/FUL: Extension (call in).

University Science Area: 11/00940/CONSLT: Science Area Masterplan (not a planning application).

#### **48. MINUTES**

Resolved to approve as a correct record the minutes of the meeting held on 10 August 2011.

**The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 9.08 pm**